

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION	Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327
THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ETHICON WAVE 5 CASES	JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN
GENERAL OPINIONS OF BOBBY SHULL, M.D.**

Defendants Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon LLC, and Johnson & Johnson (hereinafter "Defendants") move to exclude certain general opinions of one of Plaintiffs' expert, Dr. Bobby Shull, that are improper, irrelevant, unreliable, and/or are beyond his expertise as a urologist. Specifically, Defendants request that the Court preclude Dr. Shull from: (1) Testifying that the Defendants' devices are not safe in the treatment of stress urinary incontinence, because such opinions are unreliable; (2) Testifying that other surgical approaches or other synthetic mesh devices are safer alternatives to the devices at issue, because such procedures are not alternative designs and are irrelevant to a design-defect claim, and because such opinions are unreliable; (3) Offering design opinions, including opinions regarding laser-cut mesh versus mechanically-cut mesh, because he is not qualified to do so, and his opinions are unreliable and not offered within a reasonable degree of medical certainty; (4) Offering biomaterials opinions, including testimony about alleged mesh degradation, shrinkage, and other deformations opinions, because he is not qualified to do so and such opinions are unreliable, irrelevant, and/or otherwise improper; (5) Testifying about alleged conditions, because such opinions are irrelevant, highly inflammatory,

and prejudicial; (6) Offering warning opinions, because he is not qualified to do so and such opinions are irrelevant and inadmissible; (7) Testifying about testing, adverse event reporting, or training, because he is not qualified to do so and such opinions are irrelevant, speculative, and unreliable; and (8) Offering opinions beyond Dr. Shull's expertise and/or that are otherwise improper, because he is not qualified to do so and such opinions are speculative, unreliable, and/or is merely based on a narrative summary of Defendants' documents.

As grounds for this motion, Defendants submit that Dr. Shull cannot provide reliable, trustworthy and/or admissible testimony about these topics under the standard set forth in *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharm., Inc.*, 509 U.S. 579 (1993). In support of this motion, Defendants incorporate by reference its supporting memorandum of law and the following exhibits:

Exhibit	Description
Ex. A	Plaintiff List
Ex. B	Prolift +M General Report
Ex. C	<i>Brooks v. Ethicon, Inc.</i> , No. 2:12-cv-02865, Memorandum of Opinion (S.D.W. Va. July 12, 2017)
Ex. D	March 10, 2016 Deposition of Dr. Shull
Ex. E	March 15, 2016 Deposition of Dr. Shull
Ex. F	February 2013 Deposition of Dr. Shull

WHEREFORE, FOR THESE REASONS and as more fully set forth in Defendants' supporting memorandum of law, Defendants respectfully request that this Court enter an order granting Defendants' Motion to Exclude Certain general Opinions of Bobby Shull, M.D.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Christy D. Jones

Christy D. Jones
Butler Snow LLP
1020 Highland Colony Parkway
Suite 1400 (39157)
P.O. Box 6010
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010
(601) 985-4523
Christy.jones@butlersnow.com

/s/ David B. Thomas

David B. Thomas (W. Va. Bar #3731)
Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC
300 Summers Street
Suite 1380 (25301)
P.O. Box 3824
Charleston, WV 25338
(304) 414-1807
dthomas@tcspllc.com

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS
ETHICON, INC. ETHICON LLC, AND
JOHNSON & JOHNSON

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION	Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327
THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ETHICON WAVE 5 CASES	JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Christy D. Jones, certify that on this day I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ Christy D. Jones

Christy D. Jones
Butler Snow LLP
1020 Highland Colony Parkway
Suite 1400 (39157)
P.O. Box 6010
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010
(601) 985-4523
christy.jones@butlersnow.com